



Review: [untitled]

Author(s): James P. Holoka

Reviewed work(s):

A Bibliography of Studies Relating to Parry's and Lord's Oral Theory by Edward R. Haymes

Source: *The Classical World*, Vol. 68, No. 6 (Mar., 1975), pp. 385-386

Published by: Classical Association of the Atlantic States

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4348250>

Accessed: 11/02/2010 16:40

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=classaas>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Classical Association of the Atlantic States is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Classical World*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

REVIEWS

Gerald M. Quinn and
Fred Schreiber

H. F. Harding (ed.). *The Speeches of Thucydides. With a General Introduction and Introductions for the Main Speeches and the Military Harangues.* Lawrence, Kansas: Coronado Press, 1973. Pp. xii, 373. \$12.50 (cloth); \$6.00 (paper).

Thucydides' analyses of human nature, power, war, and the interrelation of these factors remain perpetually fascinating, to the amateur no less than to the professional. Harding's book represents an attempt to make available some of the most concentrated sections of Thucydidean thought, the speeches, for "the careful study of speakers, students of politics and public affairs, and especially of citizens with the right to vote" (p. v). The book consists of two parts: (1) pp. 11-220, a reprinting of the speeches in the Crawley translation, accompanied by introductory notices by Harding (the military harangues, following Jebb, are separated from the others), and (2) pp. 223-347, reprints of two famous discussions of the speeches: R. C. Jebb's excellent essay of 1880, "The Speeches of Thucydides," and John Finley's chapter, "Intellectual Background," from his *Thucydides* (1942, repr., Ann Arbor paperbacks 1963). This basic material is supplemented by a brief introduction noting especially the problem of translation (pp. 1-7), a chronological table, bibliography, five maps, and an index.

Even when read in the somewhat old fashioned but basically quite readable Crawley translation, the speeches amaze one with the force and penetration of Thucydides' mind. The very nature of the book, however, obscures one of Thucydides' most important qualities: the ability to see the relation between man's intellectual or emotional interpretation or response to a situation and how the situation in fact works itself out. Harding's introductory notes are devoted largely to making clear the main points discussed, or pointing out sets of complementary speeches. He regularly relates the speeches to the narrative context, but only in a general way, without that acute awareness of the interrelation of intellectual activity and event which de Romilly and Stahl have shown to be fundamental to Thucydides' way of thinking. In this book one misses the influence of Thucydidean scholarship since Finley, especially that in foreign languages, such as Luschnat's *RE* article, Stahl's *Thukydides*, and de Romilly's *Histoire et Raison chez Thucydide*. These writers have shown that in Thucydides, speech and event are inseparable.

Despite this fundamental weakness, the book should be useful and helpful for those for whom it is intended: students or citizens who wish to become acquainted with the perennial wisdom of the historian. The speeches, while not all his thought, are an important part of it, and the aids which Harding has provided make access to this frequently forbidding author both congenial and rewarding.

*University of North Carolina,
Chapel Hill*

Philip A. Stadter

Edward R. Haymes. *A Bibliography of Studies Relating to Parry's and Lord's Oral Theory.* (Publications of the Milman Parry Collection. Documentary and Planning Series, 1.) Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University, 1973. Pp. vii, 45. \$2.75. (paper).

This publication is billed in a prefatory advertisement as "The Haymes Bibliography," suggesting by editorial *fiat* an indispensability associated with tools

like "*Bursians Jahresberichte*," "Nairn's *Hand-list*," or "Pack's List." Comprising more than 500 items by some 280 authors, it aims to be an exhaustive directory of research on oral composition. Homeric scholarship predominates, but studies of orality in many other literatures — most notably, Anglo-Saxon — are listed as well. Given the scope of the project, the survey is remarkably thorough. Especially useful for the classicist are the complete listings of Lord's, Notopoulos's, Russo's, Whallon's, and others' investigations of oral composition.

Since "periodic supplementation and re-editions of the Haymes Bibliography are planned," perhaps the following *addenda et corrigenda* may be assimilated.

Not listed are: Bowra's *Homer* (New York 1972); Combellack's "Milman Parry and Homeric Artistry," *CL* 11 (1959) 193-208; Davison's "Homerischen Gedichte und die vergleichende Literaturforschung des Abendlandes," *Gymnasium* 61 (1954) 28-36, his "Quotations and Allusions in Early Greek Literature," *Eranos* 53 (1955) 125-40 = *From Archilochus to Pindar* (London 1968) pp. 70-85, and his "Literature and Literacy in Ancient Greece," *Phoenix* 16 (1962-63) 141-56, 219-33 = *From Archilochus to Pindar* pp. 86-128; Lesky's *AnzAW Forschungsberichte* (1951-65), and his very important "Homer's" columns in *RE Suppl.* 11 (1967) 687-846; Adam Parry's "Language and Characterization in Homer," *HSCP* 76 (1972) 1-22; Russo's review-article "The Meaning of Oral Poetry. The Collected Papers of Milman Parry: A Critical Re-assessment," *QUCC* 12 (1971) 27-39; Whallon's review of *MHV*, *CL* 24 (1972) 359-62.

Brodeur's *Art of Beowulf* was published in 1959, not 1960; Fenik's monograph is in the *Hermes Einzelschriften* series; Hansen's California dissertation has been published (UCPCS, 8: Berkeley 1972); papers by Kirk on "Homer and Modern Oral Poetry" and "Objective Dating Criteria in Homer" are reprinted in *LB* 79-89 and 174-90 respectively; Lesky's *GgL* was translated in 1966, and his "Mündlichkeit und Schriftlichkeit im homerischen Epos" is reprinted in *Gesammelte Schriften* (Bern 1966) pp. 73-81; Levin's "Portrait of a Homeric Scholar" is reprinted in *Grounds for Comparison* (Cambridge, Mass. 1972) 140-46; Lord's "Homer and Huso I" was published in 1936, not 1963, his "Homer, Parry, and Huso" is reprinted in *MHV* 465-78, and his "Oral Dictated Texts" in *LB* pp. 68-78; Marzullo's "Il problema omerico" is a preface to the 2nd edition of his book of the same title (Florence 1970); Mette's *Lustrum* bibliography has been frequently supplemented (1956-57-59-60-66-70); Adam Parry's "Language of Achilles" is reprinted in *LB* 48-54; Anne A. Parry's *CQ* paper is in vol. 21, not 65; Pope's article is 1963, not 1964; Scott's Princeton dissertation is now *Mnemosyne Supplement* 28 (Leiden 1974); the first edition of Shipp's (not Schipp) book was 1953; the vol. (vols.?) of Severyn's trilogy is not indicated; Wrenn's paper on harps is reprinted in Brodeur 118-28; Young's *Arion* article is reprinted in *Essays on Classical Literature* ed. N. Rudd (New York 1972) 33-78.

Ann Arbor

James P. Holoka

C. A. Behr (ed., tr.). *Aristides, I. Panathenaic Oration and In Defense of Oratory*. (Loeb Classical Library, 458.) Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press; London: William Heinemann, 1973. Pp. xxvi, 458. \$5.00.

This is the first of four volumes projected. It was delayed in expectation of the edition which the late Friedrich Lenz began but never completed, but the text of both orations benefits from Lenz's collations. The general introduction is a jejune account,