



Review: [untitled]

Author(s): James P. Holoka

Source: *The Classical World*, Vol. 83, No. 6 (Jul. - Aug., 1990), pp. 527-528

Published by: [Classical Association of the Atlantic States](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4350684>

Accessed: 08/01/2011 14:41

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=classaas>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Classical Association of the Atlantic States is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Classical World*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Robert Drews. *The Coming of the Greeks: Indo-European Conquests in the Aegean and the Near East*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988. Pp. xviii, 257. \$29.95. ISBN 0-691-03592-X.

1988 and 1989 produced rich reading on the Indo-Europeans. In addition to Drews' book, Colin Renfrew's *Archaeology and Language: The Puzzle of Indo-European Origins* appeared in '88 in the United States, and in '89 J. P. Mallory's *In Search of the Indo-Europeans: Language, Archaeology and Myth* was published. Mallory's book is an overview of the problem of Indo-European origins and appeared late enough to be able to take into account Renfrew's, but not Drews', rather astounding answers to the questions of when, from where and to where, why, and how did the Indo-European speakers move.

At first glance, it may seem that Drews' book is on a much narrower topic, a subset, so to speak, of the Indo-European problem: when did Indo-European speakers enter Greece. Drews' book, however, is really an answer to all the same questions Renfrew attempted, but with particular emphasis on how the Greek language arrived or developed in Greece. The methodology he uses is old: a cultural change may be an indication of the arrival of speakers of a new language group. The cultural change, however, that he chooses is somewhat new: the introduction of the horse drawn chariot c. 1600 B.C. marks the entrance of Indo-European speakers into Greece who became the Mycenaean of the shaft graves. Drews connects the entrance of these people into Greece with the development of the horse drawn chariot in Anatolia and Mesopotamia which marks there the presence of Indo-European speakers. Each reader has to decide if Drews is correct or not, because Drews has far less than convincing evidence. Indeed, no scholar has ever had convincing evidence for his or her particular solution to the problems the Indo-European languages present; hence, the many, many articles and books concerned with those problems. But what Drews does offer is a well written book which makes those problems very interesting.

Rutgers University, Camden
CW 83.6 (1990)

GERALD P. VERBRUGGHE

Robert Ackerman. *J. G. Frazer: His Life and Work*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987. Pp. x, 358, plus 11 b/w ill. \$39.95. ISBN 0-521-34093-4.

James G. Frazer is not the most promising subject for a biography. The particulars of his personal life are either uninteresting or inaccessible, but Ackerman does all that can be done with the surviving evidence for personal life, while recognizing that Frazer's life was indistinguishable from his work: emotional energies normally expended in the relationships of everyday life were sublimated in many scholarly and popular works. Because these were produced in the library by dint of undepletable *Sitzfleisch*, there are none of the adventures and hazards of field-work anthropology to enliven the story (contrast Margaret Mead's *Blackberry Winter*).

Despite these drawbacks, Ackerman has written an interesting and valuable biography. Noting at the outset that Frazer has no intellectual heirs (he "is an embarrassment") and did not shape his infant science as a founding father, he

proceeds to show what his subject's appeal was and why he was, paradoxically, so influential in "the creation of the modern spirit." In practice, this means, first of all, a painstaking review of the contents of the many multi-volume tomes brought out during the indefatigable Frazer's long writing career; his discussion alone of the permutations of the *Golden Bough* through its three editions is masterful. Though Frazer's books are flimsy armatures of argument covered by layer on layer of barely relevant comparative data, Ackerman exposes core presuppositions with insight and cogency. Highlighted throughout is Frazer's commitment to the comparative method and to rationalism, with its disparagement of "savage" thought processes and its Gibbonesque ironic denigration of Christianity.

Beyond revealing the rationale of Frazer's accounts of "primitive" religious thought, however, Ackerman provides a clear perspective on the wider intellectual world (both scholarly and lay) of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. We learn of Frazer's place (or lack of place) in the evolving field of anthropology and, with his commentaries on Pausanias, Apollodorus, and Ovid, in the more static field of classical studies. Interactions, disputes, and alliances with other scholars and thinkers are carefully recounted.

Ackerman is a model biographer. He avoids adulation and discloses shortcomings, while fairly apportioning credit for contributions to the refinement of modern conceptions of mankind's intellectual development.

Eastern Michigan University
CW 83.6 (1990)

JAMES P. HOLOKA

A. H. Armstrong (tr.). *Plotinus VI, VII*. Loeb Classical Library. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1988. Vol. VI: pp. x, 359. 0-674-99490-6. Vol. VII: pp. x, 345. ISBN 0-674-99515-5. \$13.95 each.

With the publication of these two volumes, containing the crucially important *Sixth Ennead*, Armstrong's monumental task of making available in English all of Plotinus' writings is finally complete. The Greek text printed here, as in the previous volumes, is generally that of the third volume of the revised *editio minor* of Henry and Schwyzer (*Plotini Opera* III, Oxford Classical Texts, 1982). Armstrong's departures from their text often are improvements, as at VI.4.3.15; VI.5.8.29-31, 12.6; and VI.7.7.25. The brief but valuable textual notes indicate the continuing debate about the text of the *Enneads*.

The translation is quite accurate and, it seems to me, more readable than MacKenna's, which, as Armstrong puts it, has an "esoteric-majestic style" (though he is right to stress its scholarly importance). An unprejudiced rendering is more useful to the scholar and more accessible to students (my experience, at least, attests to the latter claim). Occasionally, however, one might object that Armstrong's plain style does not ring true. For example, Plotinus says that the One *heauton egapēsē* (VI.8.16.13)—which Armstrong translates as "well pleased with himself." This almost suggests a burgherly respectability, which is out of character for the Transcendental Absolute; "loved himself" strikes the right note.

The Loeb format allows little space for scholarly interpretation; nevertheless, Armstrong's introductory notes, though very brief, characterize each